

POTENTIAL ENTREPRENEURSHIP

DETERRENCE THEORY AND LABELING OF INDUSTRIAL ACCIDENTS AS WHITE-COLLAR CRIME IN BANGLADESH APPAREL INDUSTRY: AN EPISTEMOLOGICAL STANDPOINT

MUHAMMAD FAISOL CHOWDHURY

*School of Business,
North South University, Bangladesh*

KEYWORDS: Apparel industry, readymade garment, deterrence, white-collar crime, occupational health and safety

JEL CLASSIFICATIONS: J28, L67

ABSTRACT: This paper aims to label industrial accidents as white-collar crime in Bangladesh apparel industry, where occupational health and safety provisions are mostly brushed aside by the factory owners. The study incorporates theory and evidence from over 92 sources from the criminology, legal systems, occupational health and safety systems, and industrial accidents. The study observes a severe leniency and negligence among the factory owners in advocacy and adaptation of these provisions which can be labeled as white-collar crime.

<http://dx.doi.org/10.15208/pieb.2014.09>

Vol.14 (2), PP.69-82

Source: Chowdhury M.F., 2014. "Deterrence theory and labeling of industrial accidents as white-collar crime in Bangladesh apparel industry: An epistemological standpoint", *Perspectives of Innovations, Economics & Business*, Vol.14(2), pp.69-82, <http://dx.doi.org/10.15208/pieb.2014.09>

Introduction

The export-oriented apparel manufacturing sector has made a crucial contribution in transforming the economy of Bangladesh for the last thirty years. The sector's export totaled £12 billion in the year 2011-2012 (Nur, 2013), contributing around 76% to the total export earnings of the country, which is a 14% contribution to the GDP (BGMEA, 2013a). Currently, Bangladesh with its 4.2 million garment workers working in almost five thousand factories, is the second largest exporter of apparels in the world after China (Burke et al., 2013; Pasricha, 2012). The firm work of this large pool of workers has likewise contributed in constructing the readymade garment (RMG) sector as an important foreign currency earning sector for the nation.

Despite the phenomenal success, workplace accidents have become a serious concern which has, since last several years led the growth of RMG business to a downturn. The industry has been plagued by building collapses, frequent fires, and other industrial incidents. Only in the last four years, almost 4,500 garment workers were injured, crushed, burned trampled and killed in preventable workplace accidents (Al-Mahmood, 2013; BBC, 2013). The recent worst-ever industrial accident of the country, and also the deadliest garment-factory accident in the world's history, the collapse of Rana Plaza in Savar on 24 April 2013, caused death of 1,129 workers and life-threatening injuries of 2,515 workers (CPD, 2013; IIRF, 2013). Similarly, the dreadful fire incident of Tazreen Fashion on 24 November 2012, causing death of 117 workers and severe injury to at least 200 workers, is the deadliest factory fire accident of the nation's history (Al-Mahmood, 2013; BBC, 2013; Ahmed and Paul, 2012). These

devastating accidents have jolted the entire nation, alongside other nations of the world, stimulating an outrage among the people at the negligence involved in governing occupational health and safety (OHS) provisions.

Notably, given the proliferation of the use of OHS provisions as deterrent to workplace accidents, it is noteworthy that, understanding of the concept of deterrence and its implication is absent among the RMG factory owners. This paper, therefore, firstly discusses the concept of deterrence in relation to OHS. The paper, by analysing the leniency and negligence of the factory owners in advocacy and adaptation of OHS provisions as deterrent to workplace accidents, then attempts to justify labelling this laxity as white-collar crime. An epistemological discussion has further been narrated to establish this claim.

The concept of deterrence

Deterrence theory is based upon the idea that individual conduct is shaped by the costs and benefits that might follow as consequences of that conduct - a rational calculation that weighs the chances of being caught and the severity of the punitive measures against the benefits of ignoring and escaping from standard factory compliance issues (Tombs and Whyte, 2013). A central result of Becker's (1968) theoretical formulation of deterrence theory is that, an increase in the probability and/or severity of punishment reduces the potential criminal's participation in illegitimate activities. This is the deterrence hypothesis. However, the modern economic theory of crime also focuses more broadly on the costs and benefits accruing to the potential criminal as a result of committing an offence. As such the theory offers predictions, regarding the effect on the potential criminal's decision as to whether to commit an offence of a broad range of economic and demographic factors related to the costs and benefits of criminal behaviour, as well as the effect of punishment on that decision (Bodman and Maultby, 1997). In conceptual terms, deterrence theory has been mostly challenged on two counts. Firstly, rational choice depends upon the subject having perfect knowledge of the risks of being caught. Secondly, rational choice depends upon individuals being capable of exercising rational judgement (Tombs and Whyte, 2013). Similarly, Bourdieu (1998) highlighted that the precondition for all rational conduct is the ability of the subject to imagine the consequences of a decision in the future.

In consideration to this standpoint, it is to presume that, RMG factory owners in Bangladesh are likely to possess the awareness to take decisions rationally, in precise terms - the probability of detection and punishment. Therefore, to avoid any penance, they should make better-informed operational and strategic decision in advocacy and implementation of OHS provisions. However, overwhelmingly persuasive evidence can be drawn in order to show that these factory owners are in no position to claim that they are ignorant of these OHS regulations, factory compliance issue, labor laws, and the sense of ethical and moral obligations. In fact, their willingness to act rationally is severely compromised in a situation where there is ample evidence of no worthwhile safety audit, not even any kind of investigation has been seen whatsoever from authorities like government and BGMEA (Bangladesh Garment Manufacturers and Exporters Association) (Zaman et al., 2013; Yunus and Yamagata, 2012; Ahmed and Hossain, 2009; Kawakami et al., 2004). Factory owners tend to relegate OHS provisions to a routine than any prevention or inspection function - based only on their whims and desires (Ahmed and Hossain, 2009). For instance, in terms of workplace casualty, in the United Kingdom total 148 people were killed while at work in the year 2012 to 2013 (HSE, 2013). This is a significantly low number compared to several thousands of deaths in Bangladesh only in one industry in the same time period (CPD, 2013; ILRF, 2013). Explicitly, the prime reason

of this confounding number of deaths in Bangladesh is the reluctance observed among the factory owners in governing OHS provisions as a deterrent to accidents.

Social compliance in the apparel industry is a key requirement for most of the international buyers, since a complying factory ensures labour rights, labour standards, fair labour practices, and a safe working environment (Bhattacharya et al., 2002). The relationship between OHS regulated safe work environment and labour productivity has been examined by Nur (2013), Ahamed (2012), Yunus and Yamagata (2012), Almond (2009), Alli (2008), and Berik and Rodgers (2008), where the implementation of OHS worked as a deterrent to accidents, and so, the safe work environment is found to have a positive effect on labour productivity. Similarly, a systematic risk management approach involving treating workplace injury as a problem that requires rational thinking and technical solutions - is found to be adopted by Australian employers (Walters, 2004). Their risk management approach was equipped with implementation of health and safety policies, risk assessment, safety plans and auditing, training employees involving qualified personnel from diverse backgrounds to deliver risk management services (Walters, 2004). Additionally, the understanding and consideration of deterrence by the factory owners in relation to steer away from workplace accidents through the administration of OHS provisions has previously been studied by various researchers worldwide. Studies conducted by Morillas et al. (2013) on Sweden and Spain revealed that there were considerably fewer accidents because of the implementation of OHS measures. Hori (2012) in his research on Japan, Saifullah and Ismail (2012) in their research on Malaysia, Noweir et al. (2013) on their study on the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, also showed similar findings. These researches prove that OHS as a deterrent factor safeguards workplaces from accidents.

Evasion of OHS provision and crime

It is observable that, majority of the workplace accidents took place in the RMG sector in Bangladesh in the last one decade are related to factory owners' lack of administration, negligence and avoidance of the OHS provisions in their workplaces (Alamgir and Haque, 2013; ILO, 2013; Ahmed and Hossain, 2009; Bhuiyan and Haq, 2008). It is an expected norm from the factory owners that they should have a reasonable understanding of OHS regulations and policies imposed on them by the government of Bangladesh, as well as by the foreign RMG retailers, and International Labor Organisation (ILO), in order for the regulation to work as a deterrent factor to occupational accidents. Nonetheless, these high-status industrialists are neither concerned nor interested to make calculative decisions to implement OHS as a deterrent to safeguard their factories from undesirable catastrophes.

This type of negligence and evading tendency of the employers and corporate bodies have been generalised as 'crime' with different labels by the criminologists and academicians around the world. Disdaining and evading OHS regulations and the consideration of deterrence in relation to prevention and response to corporate crimes and safety crimes were studied historically and termed as 'criminaloid' by Ross (1907); 'white-collar crime' by Sutherland (1940, 1944), Chambliss (1967), and Edelhertz (1970); 'organisational crime' by Schragger and Short (1978); 'corporate crime' by Clinard and Yeager (1980); 'organisational deviance' by Ermann and Lundman (1981); 'upper-world crime' by Geis (1982); and in recent times 'occupational crime' by Green (1997); and 'elite deviance' by Simon (2006). However, it can be argued that, the terminology of 'crime' or 'white-collar crime' can be rejected by the employers with the claim that they are not associated with the responsibility for the harm caused by the accidents. Factory owners may believe that the injuries and detach that occurred in their workplaces are not because of their negligence or recklessness, but because of employee carelessness, fate, or systems

failure. As a result, from the employers' perspective, they cannot be considered as criminals, as there are no criminal intention on their part and therefore, they should not be prosecuted. These type of employer arguments can be found in the research of Schofield et al. (2009) where the Australian employers defended themselves when they were charged with the violation of OHS which resulted in workplace accidents.

But on the other hand, in context of Bangladesh, the negligence and laxness in regulating OHS provisions by the RMG factory owners can be analysed with the framework suggested by Clinard and Quinney (1973). Building on Sutherland's (1944) concept, Clinard and Quinney suggested two divisions of white-collar crime: (a) corporate crime, and (b) occupation crime. Corporate crime is illegal behaviour that is committed to benefit the organisation or business; and occupational crime is the violations of legal codes in the course of activity in a legitimate occupation (Clinard and Quinney, 1973). Furthermore, a 'duty of care' is imposed on the employers, as they are responsible to take all necessary steps which are reasonably possible to ensure workers' health, safety and wellbeing (ACAS, 2012). If the duty is found to be breached by the employers a legal liability is imposed on them (*Donoghue v Stevenson*, UKHL 100 [1932] AC 562). In context of Bangladesh RMG sector, the failure of governing OHS provisions by the factory owners to ensure a safe and sound work environment is a serious breach of the 'duty of care' as well as a violation of the ratified ILO convention Promotional Framework for Occupational Safety and Health Convention [No.187] 2006, and Occupational Safety and Health Convention, [No.155] 1981, (ILO, 2014), which can thus be considered as an illegal behaviour committed by the employers. Maintaining compliance factors and OHS regulations provided by the retailers and local law require the employers to employ industrial advocates and Human Resource Management experts, along with a makeover of their poorly designed factories with modern facilities, safety equipments and health arrangements. This transformation requires investment which the industrialists are reluctant to make. Therefore, these employers are persuaded to continue their likelihood of evading OHS provisions to generate more profit, which in fact, falls under the category of corporate crime. Correspondingly, whenever the factory owners are avoiding or neglecting any provision of the OHS legislation, it is a violation of the legal requirement and thus it is turning into an occupational violation. So, based on the empirical theories it can be claimed that, the evasion of OHS legislation by the RMG factory owners is in fact a 'white-collar crime'.

The concept of white-collar crime

Though a wealth of definitions is available to describe white-collar crime, the concept of it is still considered as ambiguous and inconsistent. For example, US Federal Bureau of Investigation defined white-collar crime as any action of a human which involves lying, cheating and stealing in an organisational setup (FBI, n.d.). Hill and Hill (2005) expressed white-collar crime as a generic term for crimes involving commercial fraud, cheating consumers, swindles, insider trading on the stock market, embezzlement and other forms of dishonest business schemes. Although the definition of white-collar crime was pioneered by Sutherland (1940), who referred it as a crime committed by a respectable person with high social status in the course of his occupation, critics argued that Sutherland's definition is vaguely and loosely defined (Friedrichs, 2002; Edelhertz and Overcast, 1982; Robin, 1974). More specifically, Sutherland's (1940) contention that criminal justice practitioners are afraid to antagonize businessmen, triggered criticism among the social scientists and criminologists. In response, Edelhertz and Overcast (1982) by focusing on the offenders in terms of status and their workplaces, rather than the offence pointed out that, Sutherland's concept of white-collar crime does not accurately reflect the behaviours that needed to be addressed. Identically, critics argued that detection of

white-collar crime is hindered by the operative structure of such crime, since these crimes are covert, nonphysical, and not immediate in impact by nature (Edelhertz, 1970). As a result, while monetary impact of an accident is measurable, the emotional and psychological loss of the victims are found to be incalculable, as these crimes are deeply interwoven in the social structure of the society (Edelhertz, 1970). Therefore, workplace accidents tend to leave an immediate and profound effect on the workers and employees involved, and these people suffer from prolonged emotional unstableness including a sense of shock, devastation and trauma (Schofield et al., 2009).

Furthermore, Geis (1982) criticized Sutherland's (1944) attempt to ascribe corporate crimes as upper-class criminality and mentioned that these upper-world crimes cannot be readily analyzed in terms of participants' psychological experiences, because the offenders are usually unavailable for direct investigation. Additionally, Shapiro (1990) in her study strived to liberate the concept of white-collar crime by disentangling the identification of the perpetrators with their misdeeds. She suggested that, white-collar criminals violate norms of trust, enabling them to rob without violence and burgle without trespass (Shapiro, 1990). Despite all those explanations, notably, Friedrich's (2002) notion that the conceptual confusion of white-collar crimes is more plagued than any other area of criminological theory, cannot be ignored by any researcher who realizes the profound complexity related to it.

Deterrence and white-collar crime

The connection between lawbreakers and offenders with regulatory punitive actions is significantly convoluted. Academics from different standpoints provided their opinions based on different social context to explain the rationale of the people behind committing white-collar crime and their understanding of the range of sanctions aimed at deterring the crime. For example, Geis (1982) after examining different corporate crimes, concluded that assurance of punishment is one of the best deterrents against the corporate criminalities. Edelhertz (1970) pointed out that, increased penalties and additional support for the sufferers deter corporate crime. Similar studies conducted by Taxman and Piquero (1998) reflected that law breaking is inversely proportional to the quickness, sureness and intensity of the punishment. Piquero et al. (2011) similarly found that deterrence theory and criminal justice policy hold that punishment enhances compliance and deters future criminal activity. Additionally, the result of the study conducted by Herath and Rao (2009) showed that, organisational commitment and social influence have a significant impact on OHS and compliance intentions among the factory owners. The adaption of an effective OHS model to deter accidents is affected by organisational, environmental and behavioural factors (Hearth and Rao, 2009).

Since the early empirical research which reported evidence that deterrence reduces crime (Layson, 1985; Witte, 1980; Ehrlich, 1975; 1973), Harbaugh et al. (2013) based on those studies highlighted that the main challenge in empirical analysis has been to tackle the simultaneity between criminal activity and deterrence. So, an increase in deterrence in the form of OHS provision is expected to reduce the white-collar crime, but a change in crime is also expected to prompt an increase in the certainty and severity of punishment, through mechanisms such as an increase in the arrest rate, or size of the industrial police force. This makes it difficult to identify the causal impact of deterrence on crime (Harbaugh, 2013).

Remarkably, Gunningham and Johnstone's (1999) 'two track' model of OHS regulation have been used by policy makers in the UK to justify the withdrawal of regulatory resources and the move away from both inspection regimes and enforcement

practices (Tombs and Whyte, 2010a). Since this model targets the worst offenders (Tombs and Whyte, 2010b), Tombs and Whyte (2013) argued that despite the lack of the theoretical justification and empirical evidence supporting such as approach, the institutionalization of this model is based on the idea that the vast majority of British corporations are good performers as they through self-regulation take rational decisions to comply with regulatory requirements (Hampton, 2005). Dissimilar to this, the Australian government has differentiated white-collar crimes and OHS offences in several categories based on their level or risk or serious harm created because of the recklessness or negligence of the business owners on the basis of the concept of 'duty of care' (McCallum and Reeve, 2009). Each of these categories of offence is to be accompanied by escalating monetary penalties, with the worst offences involving high level of risk or serious harm, attracting extremely high fines and imprisonment (McCallum and Reeve, 2009; Stewart-Crompton et al., 2009). Besides, the research conducted by Schofield et al. (2009) in Australian workforce affirmed the importance of prosecution in preventing workplace injuries and deaths. The same research further indicated that an increased use of prosecution and a greater severity and range of sanctions for OHS breaches reduced the amount of accidents significantly in the state of Victoria and New South Wales (Schofield et al., 2009).

From this discussion, it can be confirmed that, humans are rational beings who are motivated primarily to avoid sufferings and distress and look for happiness and unstressed situations. People possess knowledge regarding harmful actions and they are deterred in most cases by fear of negative consequences (Lapham and Todd, 2011). With respect to avoid OHS and number of workplace accidents in Bangladesh, though the factory owners are aware of the laws and sanctions pertinent to this behaviour, following the theory of Ross (1985), it can be argued that these assumptions may not be applicable across all factory owners.

Given the situation of Bangladesh RMG sector, by assuming that majority of the employers are self-regulated and good performers, implementation of two-track regulatory system similar to the UK would be very risky. A recent report published by ILO (2013) identified that, dearth of consciousness, preparation, non-agreements of OHS values by the RMG factories in Bangladesh, an undesirable participation of the employees and workers could not attain the objective of providing protection and wellbeing to the workers as projected by the OHS regulation. The working condition in most garment factories in Bangladesh is deplorable and owners pay little attention to labour standards and labour rights, discard fair labour practices, and neglect OHS regulations, which cause not only disastrous accidents, but also serious violation of human rights (Majumder, 2008). When these basic requirements are ignored by employers, workers become frantic to materialise their demands through stopping work, demonstration and vandalism (Bhuiyan, 2013). In this state, the relationship between workers and management turns into turmoil and trepidation and the overall economic and social condition of the country remain jeopardised (Ahamed, 2012; Rahman et al., 2008). These issues are in fact sufficient enough to prove the point that, violation of OHS regulations by the factory owners is a white-collar crime, which is often ignored or unnoticed by the government of the country. As no significant action has yet been taken to penalise the offenders and none has ever been prosecuted over the deaths and injuries of thousands of workers by the industrial accidents so far, (Paul and Quadir, 2013; Guardian, 2013a), many of the illegal accident prone factories continue to operate in full swing with lacked building permits and without proper OHS provisions (Ahamed, 2012).

Furthermore, a significant academic and political animosity over the role of prosecution in OHS enforcement strategies is present in Bangladesh. The majority of research currently favours a strict enforcement of OHS legislation with exemplarily punishment to the offenders which will hinder the accidents (ILO, 2013; Zaman et al.,

2013; Young, 2013; Haider, 2007). However, the government's and policy makers' attempt to induce OHS using amenable enforcement option such as less monetary fine and delayed trials, provide easy escape routes for the factory owners to carry on with their crimes and continue their business without any trouble (CPD, 2013; Ahmed, 2012, Bhuiyan and Haq, 2008). It has also been identified that a considerable number of parliamentarians are directly invested as factory owners and another large chunk of the factories are owned by their friends, relatives and acquaintance (Economist, 2013a).

Global buyers and their standpoint

As an ongoing attempt towards responsible business practice, renowned global brands by outsourcing their manufacturing to Bangladeshi factories, frequently assure consumers that their clothing is made ethically, and the factories audited for OHS compliance, and certified to be safe with decent working conditions (ILRF, 2013). Being bewildered by this claim, many researchers investigated the working conditions in RMG industries and found that the workplace environment in the factories is below the ILO standard. These researchers argued that, workers of these factories are concerned with long working hours and double consecutive shifts, unsafe work environment, poor working conditions, wage and gender discrimination, ineffective building codes, and other occupational hazards. Indeed, employers tend to exploit these workers to increase their profit margins and keep their industry competitive in the face of increasing international competition (Bhuiyan, 2013; ILRF, 2013; Young, 2013; Morshed, 2007; Dasgupta, 2002).

As a result of these studies and anger fuelled by recent accidents, these retailers have been questioned to justify their claim on ethical business practice and compliance audits with the local manufacturers by the perplexed consumers around the globe. Interestingly, in response, some of these big brands have said to be contemplating doing just that - not because they fear that higher standards in Bangladeshi factories will raise their product costs, but because they fear that another tragedy would damage their reputation (Economists, 2013b). Contradictorily, Scott Nova, from the Worker Rights Consortium, claimed that these foreign auditors are frequently bribed by the factory owners and they do not inspect or investigate workers right issues and factories' structural soundness or fire safety violations (Economist, 2013a).

Addressing this issue, Michael Connarty, the UK's Falkirk East MP called on the British Government to push through new legislation to end modern day slavery by forcing major retailers in the UK to audit their supply chain. The framework is to request those companies to make vigorous checks to ensure slave labour is not used in third world countries like Bangladesh, to produce their goods (Falkirk Herald, 2013). On another occasion Nick Clegg, current UK Deputy Prime Minister and leader of the Liberal Democrats said: "There's more we could do to talk about what goes on behind the scenes and this terrible catastrophe might well prompt people to think again." (Express UK, 2013). Alongside, Karel De Gucht, current European Commissioner for Trade criticised most British MPs for their ignorant view towards the EU's stance on promoting and monitoring OHS provisions in developing countries and warned that global retailers and the Bangladesh government could face action from the European Union if nothing is done to improve the conditions of workers, adding that British shoppers should also consider where they are spending their money (Hasting, 2013). On the contrary, some researchers suggested that, it is the sole responsibility of Bangladesh government to exert and exercise OHS provisions (BGMEA, 2013b; Zaman et al., 2013; Haider, 2007; Lyon and Boardman, 2006). Alternatively, influential body's like ILO, along with some largest retailers have showed their concern towards a joint effort by government and factory owners for maximum promotion and optimisation

of a modernised OHS provisions (ILO, 2013; Guardian, 2013b; Ahmed and Hossain, 2009, Schofield, 2007).

From the above discussion, it is noteworthy that the concept of deterrence is yet absent among the factory owners irrespective of an escalation of demand made by all these concerned authorities and governing bodies in administering OHS provisions as a deterrent to workplace accidents. In fact, by looking at the last several years' catastrophic accidents in Bangladesh RMG industry, the concept of deterrence and its impact cannot be seen as properly understood by the employers.

Epistemological standpoint and conclusion

The study of deterrence concept and its alignment with OHS in terms of avoiding workplace accidents in context of Bangladesh RMG sector cannot be found studied by any other researcher so far. Although a large number of studies were conducted covering the areas like technical reasons of the workplace accidents (CIPD, 2013; ILO, 2013; ILRF, 2013; Zaman et al., 2013; Ahmed, 2012; Ahmed and Hossain, 2009), competitiveness of Bangladesh RMG industry (Haider, 2007, and industrial relations issues (Bhuiyan, 2013; Yunus and Yamagata, 2012; Berik and Rodgers, 2008; Absar, 2001), most of these pieces of research are inconclusive about the concept of deterrence and explaining how it works in relation to OHS. Similarly, a few other researchers suggested different processes of exercising regulatory controls over the conduct of individuals and corporate bodies and courses of actions to protect workers from workplace injuries and accidents (Davies et al., 2011; Bhuiyan and Haq, 2008; Kawakami et al., 2004). Besides, the understanding of white-collar crime in relation to evade and ignore OHS provisions by the factory owners were not elucidated by their research.

As a result, this study concentrates in the theories and frameworks suggested by the researchers from developed countries, where the epistemological considerations of those researchers precisely probed into the dimensions of deterrence in terms of OHS provisions, and the concept of white-collar crime in relation to the employers who tend to neglect OHS provisions. Epistemology is concerned with providing a philosophical grounding for deciding what kinds of knowledge are possible and how we ensure it is adequate and legitimate (Maynard, 1994). Considering this, a dominant constructivist approach can be found among many researchers in addressing their study on deterrence and white-collar crime. For example, many researchers who examined OHS and deterrence showed a relativist, transactional, and subjectivist approach in conducting their analysis. Adopting a relativist stance means that there is no objective truth to be known (Hugly and Sayward, 1987) and it emphasises the diversity of interpretations that can be applied to the world. These research works were transactional and from social constructionism perspective, which tells that the truth arises from interactions between elements of some rhetorical situation (Berlin, 1987), and is the product these interactions and the individual's thoughts as constructed realities (Denzin and Lincoln, 2005). On the other hand, several researches on white-collar crime followed a 'grounded theory' approach (Walker and Myrick, 2006) where the researchers' discovered the truth that lies within the object of investigation, with reality existing independently of any consciousness. As highlighted by Charmaz (2006, p.330), research based on grounded theory is consistent with a constructivist epistemology and ontology by "...placing priority on the phenomena of study and seeing both data and analysis as created from shared experiences and relationships with participants and other sources."

Correspondingly, some other researchers followed interpretivism to investigate this topic. The concept of white-collar crime, deterrence, OHS, and workplace accidents belong to the social science arena, and so, these researchers rejected empiricism and the scientific method in conducting the research. In this case they focused on understanding the interpretations that social actions have for the people being studied in their research. In order to study the deterrence concept and its

understanding among the factory owners, these researches applied intentionalism approach - where the actual meaning of the information is determined by the research participants and interviewees (Collingwood, 1946). It is argued by Schwandt (2005) that, to understand the meaning of human action requires grasping the subjective consciousness or intent of the actor from the inside. He further claimed that, constructivism more generally was synonymous with a interpretivist approach. He opposed the application of the positivists approach to the social sciences, since people's actions are not related to the general laws of nature, being highly complex and dependent on their habits, emotions, beliefs and rationales.

Furthermore, some researchers followed interpretivism constituting unstructured interviews to explore people's individual and collective understandings on these research issues, a model highlighted by Mason (2013), and Blaikie (2000). It can be confirmed from these researchers's ontological position that people's knowledge, views, understanding, interpretations and experiences are meaningful properties of the social reality which their research questions were designed to explore. In light of that, these researchers further examined other secondary data sources like texts and constitutions, for example: factory Code of Conduct, compliance standard of foreign retails and OHS legislation. Thus, it is justified that this interpretivist epistemological approach facilitated an in-depth investigation of particular instances of phenomena on deterrence and can be regarded as a suitable research methodology for an analysis of these research topics.

Notably, most of these studies on deterrence, OHS breaches and white-collar crime, which have been highlighted in this paper are from advanced economies. Given that these contexts are quite different from that of Bangladesh, data from these researches must be approached with some caution. Further, majority of these researchers did not take Bangladesh into their research account, and few of them focused on the context of Bangladesh apparel industry. Therefore, a missing link in evading OHS and labeling it as white-collar crime, and the concept of deterrence in context of workplace accidents between these developed countries and an underdeveloped country like Bangladesh is found.

Yet, it is to be pointed out that, for a research that claims to be subjectivists in nature and epistemologically follows interpretivism or constructivism, the research may have several implication. Lincoln and Guba (1985) highlighted that, in such an epistemological standpoint social research produces multiple constructed realities that has to be studied holistically. They further argued that humans should be the primary data collection instrument, since it is difficult to investigate non-human instruments that could interact with participants in a way that would reveal their multiple constructed realities. Additionally, as they highlighted "...the knower and the known are inseparable..." (Lincoln and Guba, 1985, p.37), the research participants should be in a natural setting, since the participants' realities are wholes that cannot be understood in isolation from their contexts.

In the end, it is to be noted that, the researches which are studied to prepare this paper are inspired basically by subjectivists standpoint where qualitative, interpretivist, and social constructivist approach have been followed. These research works are constituted of intensive qualitative interviews and researchers' observation, case studies, and other form of secondary text and literature studies. However, some researchers have alternatively followed a philosophical hermeneutics stance to explain the topics, whereas, others have relied on grounded theory approach by comparing and contrasting the concept of white-collar crime and deterrence in various social context.

Future Research

The research topics of deterrence theory in context of OHS, and the concept of white-collar crime is better understood as an institutional process that is played out in combinations of state-based, and foreign retailers involved in the development and implementation of the law and penalties that address workplace accidents and criminality. As a result, future research on this topic should aim a qualitative case

study approach to explain the concepts - that draws on sociological thinking about the dynamics of organisational processes associated with it. This type of case based approach has been suggested by Yin (2009), and Leedy (1997), since case study is the 'fact' of any particular issue, the contents of which require an in-depth focus of the social science area to understand its phenomenon on the basis of it being an individual problem. To conduct a robust research in this topic, case study approach would give the researchers flexibility and would ensure that the answers of the research questions are not explored "through one lens, but rather a variety of lenses" Baxter and Jack (2008), which would allow for multiple facets of the phenomena to be revealed and understood.

References

- Absar, S.S., 2001. "Problems Surrounding Wages: The Readymade Garments Sector in Bangladesh", *Labour and Management in Development Journal*, Vol.2, No.7, pp.3-7
- ACAS - Advisory, Conciliation and Arbitration Service, 2012. "Defining An Employer's Duty of Care", <http://www.acas.org.uk/index.aspx?articleid=3751> (accessed 23 November 2013)
- Ahamed, F., 2012, "Improving Social Compliance in Bangladesh's Ready-made Garment Industry", *Labour and Management in Development*, Vol.13, pp.1-26
- Ahmed, J.U. and Hossain, T., 2009. "Industrial Safety in the Readymade Garment Sector: A Developing Country Perspective", *Sri Lankan Journal of Management*, Vol.14, No.1, pp.1-13
- Ahmed, A. and Paul, R., 2012. "Bangladesh's Worst Ever Factory Blaze Kills Over 100", *Reuters*, <http://www.reuters.com/article/2012/11/25/us-bangladesh-fire-idUSBRE8AN0CG20121125> (accessed 13 November 2013)
- Alamgir, M. and Haque, M., 2013. "730 RMG Workers Killed in Fires, Factory Collapses in 11 Years", *New Age Bangladesh*, <http://www.newagebd.com/detail.php?date=2013-04-25&nid=47200> (accessed 19 October 2013)
- Alli, B.O., 2008. *Principles of Occupational Health and Safety*, International Labour Organization, Geneva
- Al-Mahmood, S.Z., 2013. "Deadly Fire Hits Bangladesh Factory", *Wall Street Journal*, <http://online.wsj.com/news/articles/SB10001424052702304171804579123704212316452> (accessed 24 October 2013)
- Almond, P., 2009. "The Danger of Hanging Baskets: Regulatory Myths and Media Representations of Health and Safety Regulation", *Journal of Law and Society*, Vol.36, No.3, pp.352-375
- Baxter, P. and Jack, S., 2008. "Qualitative Case Study Methodology: Study Design and Implementation for Novice Researchers", *The Qualitative Report*, Vol.13, No.4, pp.544-559
- BBC - British Broadcasting Corporation, 2013. "Bangladesh Clothing Factory Hit by Deadly Fire", <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-asia-24453165> (accessed 24 October 2013)
- Becker, G.S., 1968. "Crime and Punishment: An Economic Approach", *Journal of Political Economy*, Vol.76, No.2, pp.169-217
- Berik, G. and Rodgers, Y.V.D.M., 2008. "Options for Enforcing Labour Standards: Lessons from Bangladesh and Cambodia", *Journal of International Development*, Vol.22, No.1, pp.56-85.
- Berlin, J.A., 1987. *Rhetoric and Reality: Writing Instruction in American Colleges*, Southern Illinois University Press, Illinois
- BGMEA - Bangladesh Garment Manufacturers and Exporters Association, 2013a. "Main Functions of BGMEA", <http://www.bgmea.com.bd/home/pages/aboutus> (accessed 20 October 2013)
- BGMEA - Bangladesh Garment Manufacturers and Exporters Association, 2013b, "Trade Information", <http://www.bgmea.com.bd/home/pages/TradeInformation#.U4MHfxbXmFI> (accessed 19 October 2013)
- Bhattacharya, D., Rahman, M. and Raihan, A., 2002. *Contribution of the RMG Sector to the Bangladesh Economy*, Centre for Policy Dialogue, Dhaka

- Bhuiyan, M.I., 2013. "Reasonable Wages for Workers to Eliminate Unrest in Bangladesh's Readymade Garments (RMG) Sector", Bangladesh Development Research Working Paper No.17, Bangladesh Development Research Center, http://www.bangladeshstudies.org/files/WPS_no17.pdf (accessed 25 October 2013)
- Bhuiyan, A.J. and Haq, M.N., 2008. "Improving Occupational Safety and Health in Bangladesh", *International Journal of Occupational and Environmental Health*, Vol.14, No.3, pp.231-233
- Blaikie, N., 2000. *Designing Social Research*, Polity Press, Cambridge
- Bodman, P.M. and Maultby, C., 1997. "Crime, Punishment and Deterrence in Australia: A Further Empirical Investigation", *International Journal of Social Economics*, Vol.24, No.7/8/9, pp.884-901
- Bourdieu, P., 1998. *Acts of Resistance: Against the Tyranny of the Market*, The New Review Press, New York
- Burke, J., Hammadi, S. and Neville, S., 2013. "Fashion Chains Sign Accord to Help Finance Safety in Bangladesh Factories", *The Guardian*, <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/may/13/fashionchain-finance-safety-bangladesh-factories> (accessed 17 October 2013)
- Chambliss, W.J., 1967. "Types of Deviance and the Effectiveness of Legal Sanctions", *Wisconsin Law Review*, Issue. Summer, pp.703-714
- Charmaz, K., 2006. *Constructing Grounded Theory: A Practical Guide through Qualitative Analysis*, Sage Publications, London
- Clinart, M.B. and Quinney, R., 1973. *Criminal Behavior Systems: A Typology*, Holt, Rinehart and Winston, New York
- Clinard, M.B. and Yeager, P.C., 1980. *Corporate Crime*, The Free Press, New Jersey
- Collingwood, R.G., 1946. *The Idea of History*, Oxford University Press, Oxford
- CPD - Centre for Policy Dialogue, 2013. *100 Days of Rana Plaza Tragedy, First Independent Monitoring Report on Commitment and Delivery*, Centre for Policy Dialogue, Dhaka.
- Dasgupta, S., 2002. "Attitudes Towards Trade Unions in Bangladesh, Brazil, Hungary and Tanzania", *International Labour Review*, Vol.141, No.4, pp.413-440
- Davies, H., Koehlmoos, T.P., Courtice, M.N. and Ahmad, S.A., 2011. "Occupational Injury in Rural Bangladesh: Data Gathering Using Household Survey", *International Journal of Occupational Environment and Health*, Vol.17, No.3, pp.214-222
- Denzin, N.K. and Lincoln, Y.S. (Eds.), 2005. *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research*, 3rd ed, Sage Publications, London
- Donoghue v Stevenson, UKHL 100 [1932] AC 562, the principle case of Donoghue v Stevenson, <http://www.bailii.org/uk/cases/UKHL/1932/100.html> (accessed 23 November 2013)
- Economist, 2013a. "Disaster in Bangladesh: The New Collapsing Building", <http://www.economist.com/blogs/banyan/2013/04/disaster-bangladesh> (accessed 26 October 2013)
- Economist, 2013b. "Avoiding The Fire Next Time", available at: <http://www.economist.com/news/business/21577078-after-dhaka-factory-collapse-foreign-clothing-firms-are-underpressure-improve-working> (accessed 26 October 2013)
- Edelhertz, H., 1970. *The Nature, Impact and Prosecution of White-collar Crime*, US Department of Justice, Washington, DC
- Edelhertz, H. and Overcast, T.D., 1982. *White-collar Crime: An Agenda for Research*, Lexington Books, Massachusetts
- Ehrlich, I., 1973. "Participation in Illegitimate Activities: A Theoretical and Empirical Investigation", *The Journal of Political Economy*, Vol.81, No.3, pp.521-565
- Ehrlich, I., 1975. "The Deterrent Effect of Capital Punishment: A Question of Life and Death", *The American Economic Review*, Vol.65, No.3, pp.397-417
- Ermann, M.D. and Lundman, R.J., 1981. "Corporate Violations of the Corrupt Practices Act", in Edelhertz, H. and Overcast, T. (Eds.), *White-collar Crime: An Agenda for Research*, D.C. Health, Lexington
- Express UK, 2013. "Millionaire Nick Clegg Reveals His Love of Primark", <http://www.express.co.uk/news/uk/396443/Millionaire-Nick-Clegg-reveals-his-love-of-Primark> (accessed 26 November 2013)

- Falkirk Herald, The, 2013. "MP Calls for End to Modern Day Slave Trade", <http://www.falkirkherald.co.uk/news/local-news/mp-calls-for-end-to-modern-day-slave-trade-1-2917850> (accessed 19 October 2013)
- FBI - Federal Bureau of Investigation, n.d. "White-collar Crime", http://www.fbi.gov/about-us/investigate/white_collar (accessed 24 November 2013)
- Friedrichs, D.O., 2002. "Occupational Crime, Occupational Deviance, and Workplace Crime", *Criminal Justice*, Vol.2, No.3, pp.243-256
- Geis, G., 1982. *On White-Collar Crime*, D.C. Health, Lexington
- Green, G.S., 1997. *Occupational Crime*, 2nd ed., Nelson-Hall Publishers, Chicago
- Guardian, The, 2013a. "Bangladesh Factory Owners and Building Engineers Arrested", <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/apr/27/bangladesh-factory-owners-engineers-arrested> (accessed 26 February 2013)
- Guardian, The, 2013b. "Bangladesh's Garment Workers Face Exploitation, But is it Slavery?", <http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/poverty-matters/2013/may/16/bangladesh-garment-workers-exploitation-slavery> (accessed 30 October 2013)
- Gunningham, N. and Johnstone, R, 1999. *Regulating Workplace Safety: Systems and Sanctions*, Oxford University Press, Oxford
- Haider, M.Z., 2007. "Competitiveness of the Bangladesh Ready-made Garment Industry in Major International Market", *Asia-Pacific Trade and Investment Review*, Vol.3, No.1, pp.3-27
- Hampton, P., 2005. *Reducing Administrative Burdens: Effective Inspection and Enforcement*, HM Treasury/HMSO, London
- Harbaugh, W.T., Mocan, N. and Visser, M.S., 2013. "Theft and Deterrence", *Journal of Labour Research*, Vol.34, No.12, pp.389-407
- Hasting, R., 2013, "Top EU Official: British MPs Know Nothing About Europe and Pulling Out of the EU Would be A Clear Disaster for Britain", *The Independent*, <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/politics/top-eu-official-british-mps-know-nothing-about-europe-andpulling-out-of-the-eu-would-be-a-clear-disaster-for-britain-8605212.html> (accessed 19 October 2013)
- Hearth, T. and Rao, R., 2009. "Protection Motivation and Deterrence: A Framework for Security Policy Compliance in Organisations", *European Journal of Information Systems*, Vol.18, No.6, pp.106-125
- Hill, G.N. and Hill, K.T., 2005. "White-collar Crime", *Legal Dictionary*, <http://legal-dictionary.thefreedictionary.com/white+collar+crime> (accessed 24 November 2013)
- Hori, M., 2012. "The Trend and Issues of Occupational Safety and Health in Japan", *Procedia Engineering*, Vol.43, pp.610-614
- HSE - Health and Safety Executive UK, 2013. "Health and Safety Statistics", <http://www.hse.gov.uk/statistics/index.htm> (accessed 30 October 2013)
- Hugly, P. and Sayward, C., 1987. "Why Substitutional Quantification Does Not Express Existence", *Theory and Decision*, Vol.50, pp.67-75
- ILO - International Labor Organization, 2014. "Occupational Safety and Health Country Profile: Bangladesh", <http://www.ilo.org/safework/countries/asia/bangladesh/lang--en/index.htm> (accessed 26 May 2014)
- ILO - International Labor Organization, 2013. "ILO, EU, Bangladesh Government Adopt New Compact on Garment Factory Safety", http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/activities/all/WCMS_217271/lang-en/index.htm (accessed 17 October 2013)
- ILRF - International Labor Rights Forum, 2013. "Exemplary Failures of Walmart, Gap, and other Apparel Brands and Retailers' Unilateral and Unenforceable Social Auditing Programs", <http://www.laborrights.org/sites/default/files/news/Failures%20of%20unilateral%20and%20unenforceable%20social%20auditing%20programs.pdf> (accessed 18 October 2013)
- Kawakami, T., Kogi, K., Toyama, N. and Yoshikawa, T., 2004. "Participatory Approaches to Improving Safety and Health Under Trade Union Initiative - Experiences of Positive Training Program in Asia", *Industrial Health*, Vol.42, No.2, pp.196-206

- Lapham, S.C. and Todd, M., 2012. "Do Deterrence and Social-Control Theories Predict Driving After Drinking 15 Years after a DWI Conviction", *Accident Analysis and Prevention*, Vol.45, pp.142-151
- Layson, S.K., 1985. "Homicide and Deterrence: A Reexamination of the United States Time-Series Evidence", *Southern Economic Journal*, Vol.52, No.1, pp.68-89
- Leedy, P.D., 1997. *Practical Research: Planning and Design*, Prentice-Hall, New Jersey
- Lincoln, Y.S. and Guba, E.G., 1985. *Naturalistic Inquiry*, Sage Publications, California
- Lyon, A. and Boardman, J., 2006. "Defining Best Practice in Corporate Occupational Health and Safety Governance", research report No.506, Acona Health and Safety Executive, London
- Mason, J., 2013. *Qualitative Researching*, 2nd ed., Sage Publications, London
- Majumder, P.P., 2008. "Gender Differentiated Impact of Employment in the Manufacturing Sector of Bangladesh on the Mental Health of Worker: A Case Study of Employment in the Garment Industry", *Empowerment*, Vol.15, pp.1-22
- Maynard, M., 1994. *Methods, Practice and Epistemology: The Debate about Feminism and Research*, Taylor and Francis, London
- McCallum, R. and Reeve, B., 2009. "The National Review into Model OHS Law: Offences Relating to Breaches of the Duty of Care, Defences, and Related Matters", working paper 68, National Research Centre for OHS Regulation, Australian National University, Canberra
- Morillas, R.M., Rubio-Romero, J.C. and Fuertes, A., 2013. "A Comparative Analysis of Occupational Health and Safety Risk Prevention Practices in Sweden and Spain", *Journal of Safety Research*, Vol.47, Issue. December, pp.57-65
- Morshed, M.M., 2007. "A Study on Labour Rights Implementation in Readymade Garment (RMG) Industry in Bangladesh: Bridging the Gap between Theory and Practice", thesis paper of Social Change and Development, University of Wollongong, New South Wales, <http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/40> (accessed 25 October 2013)
- Nur, S.A., 2013. "Space Shortages at Rented Houses Makes RMG Units Noncompliant", *The Financial Express*, Vol.20, No.157, pp.1
- Noweir, M.H., Alidrisi, M.M., Al-Darrab, I.A. and Zytoon, M.A., 2013. "Occupational Safety and Health Performance of the Manufacturing Sector in Jeddah Industrial Estate, Saudi Arabia: A 20 years Follow-up Study", *Safety Science*, Vol.53, Issue. March, pp.11-24
- Pasricha, A., 2012. "Thriving Bangladesh Garment Industry Under Scrutiny", *Voice of America*, <http://www.voanews.com/content/thriving-bangladesh-garment-industry-comes-under-scrutiny/1510030.html> (accessed 27 October 2013)
- Paul, R. and Quadir, S., 2013. "Bangladesh Urges No Harsh EU Measures Over Factory Deaths", *Reuters*, <http://www.reuters.com/article/2013/05/04/us-bangladesh-factory-idUSBRE94304420130504> (accessed 26 October 2013)
- Piquero, A.R., Paternoster, R., Pogarsky, G. and Loughran, T., 2011. "Elaborating the Individual Component in Deterrence Theory", *Annual Review of Law and Social Science*, Vol.7, pp.335-360
- Rahman, M., Bhattacharya, D. and Moazzem, K.G., 2008. *Bangladesh Apparel Sector in Post MFA Era: A Study on the Ongoing Restructuring Process*, Centre for Policy Dialogue, Dhaka.
- Robin, G., 1974. "White-collar Crime and Employee Theft", *Crime and Delinquency*, Vol.20, No.3, pp.251-262
- Ross, E.A., 1907. *Sin and Society: An Analysis of Latter-Day Iniquity*, Houghton Mifflin, Boston.
- Ross, H.L., 1985. "Deterring Drunken Driving: An Analysis of Current Efforts", *Journal of Studies on Alcohol and Drugs*, Vol.10, No.8, pp.122-128
- Saifullah, N. M. and Ismail, F., 2012. "Integration of Occupational Safety and Health During Pre-construction Stage in Malaysia", *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, Vol.35, pp.603-610
- Schofield, T., 2007. "Deterring Workplace Deaths and Injuries: Legal Sanctions and Outcomes or Institutional Process?", in Curtis, B., Matthewman, S. and McIntosh, T. (Eds), *Public Sociologies: Lessons and Trans-Tasman Comparisons*, TASA/SAANZ 2007 Joint Conference Proceedings, Department of Sociology, University of Auckland, Auckland
- Schofield, T. Reeve, B. and McCallum, R., 2009. "Deterrence and OHS Prosecutions: Prosecuted

- Employers' Responses", *Journal of Occupational Health and Safety - Australia and New Zealand*, Vol.25, No.4, pp.263-276
- Schrager, L.S. and Short, J.F. Jr., 1978. "Toward A Sociology of Organizational Crime", *Social Problems*, Vol.25, No.4, pp.407-419
- Schwandt, T.A., 2005. "A Diagnostic Reading of Scientifically Based Research for Education", *Educational Theory*, Vol.55, No.3, pp.285-305
- Simon, D.R., 2006. *Elite Deviance*, 10th ed. Pearson Education, California
- Shapiro, S.P., 1990. "Collaring the Crime, Not the Criminal: Reconsidering the Concept of White-collar Crime", *American Sociological Review*, Vol.55, No.3, pp.346-365
- Stewart-Crompton, E., Sherriff, B. and Mayman, S., 2009. "National Review into Model OHS Laws Second Report", Australian Government Department of Employment, <http://docs.employment.gov.au/node/1659> (accessed 28 November 2013)
- Sutherland, E.H., 1944. "Is White Collar Crime Crime?", *American Sociological Review*, Vol.10, No.2, pp.132-139
- Sutherland, E.H., 1940. "White-collar Criminality", *American Sociological Review*, Vol.5 No.1, pp.1-12
- Taxman, F.S. and Piquero, A., 1998. "On Preventing Drunk Driving Recidivism: An Examination of Rehabilitation and Punishment Approaches", *Journal of Criminal Justice*, Vol.26, No.2, pp.129-143
- Tombs, S. and Whyte, D., 2013. "The Myths and Realities of Deterrence in Workplace Safety Regulation", *British Journal of Criminology*, Vol.53, No.6, pp.746-763
- Tombs, S. and Whyte, D., 2010a. "A Deadly Consensus: Workers Safety and Regulatory Degradation Under New Labour", *British Journal of Criminology*, Vol.50, No.1, pp.46-65
- Tombs, S. and Whyte, D., 2010b. *Regulatory Surrender: Death, Injury and Non-Enforcement of Law*, Institute of Employment Rights, London
- Walker, D. and Myrick, F., 2006. "Grounded Theory: An Exploration of Process and Procedure", *Qualitative Health Research*, Vol.16, No.4, pp.547-559
- Walters, D., 2004. "Workplace Arrangements for Worker Participation in OHS", in Bluff, L., Gunningham, N. and Johnstone, R. (Eds). *OHS Regulation for a Changing World of Work*, Federation Press, Sydney
- Whitte, A.D., 1980. "Estimating Economic Models for Crime with Individual Data", *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, Vol.94, No.1, pp.57-84
- Yin, R.K., 2009. *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*, 3rd ed., Sage Publications, California
- Young, E., 2013. "Bangladesh Textile Workers' Deaths Avoidable", *British Broadcasting Corporation*, <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/business-22296645> (accessed 17 October 2013)
- Yunus, M. and Yamagata, T., 2012. "The Garment Industry in Bangladesh", *Dynamics of the Garment Industry in Low Income Countries Report No.6*, Institute of Developing Economics, Japan External Trade Organization, Japan
- Zaman, F., Samaduzzaman, M. and Irfan, M.S., 2013. "Readymade Garments Industry (RMG) Sector in Bangladesh: Is Occupational Health and Safety Provision Will be Regulated by the Entrepreneurs or Government?" *Research Journal of Economics and Business Studies*, Vol.2, No.4, pp.28-34